

DRAFT

Tracing Ancient Threads in the Book of Moses
2020 Interpreter Foundation Conference
September 18-19, 2020

**“This Thing Is a Similitude”:
A Typological Approach to Moses 5:4-15 and Ancient Apocryphal Literature
David Calabro**

Introduction

One of the most significant features of the Book of Moses is its account of the redemption of Adam and Eve following their expulsion from the garden of Eden, an account which is completely absent from the parallel parts of the received text of Genesis.¹ This account begins immediately following the notice of Adam and Eve working and having children, the portion of the text corresponding to Genesis 4:1a: “And Adam knew Eve his wife.”² In Moses 5:4-11, we read of Adam and Eve receiving divine communications and offering sacrifice:

4 And Adam and Eve, his wife, called upon the name of the Lord,³ and they heard the voice of the Lord from the way toward the Garden of Eden, speaking unto them, and they saw him not; for they were shut out from his presence.

5 And he gave unto them commandments, that they should worship the Lord their God, and should offer the firstlings of their flocks, for an offering unto the Lord. And Adam was obedient unto the commandments of the Lord.

¹ I wish to thank Jeffrey Bradshaw for his helpful comments and bibliographic suggestions on earlier versions of this paper.

² The latter part of Genesis 4:1 identifies Cain as the first child born to Adam and Eve. Thus the agriculturalist Cain and the shepherd Abel are the first people explicitly having those professions (Genesis 4:2), and we never read of Adam fulfilling the commandment or curse to eat his bread “in the sweat of [his] face” (Genesis 3:19). The Moses account presents a more fleshed-out picture: Adam and Eve labor in both agriculture and animal husbandry, whereby Adam fulfills the commandment (here explicitly stated as such) to eat his bread “by the sweat of his brow” (Moses 5:1). Further, before having Cain and Abel, they have other children who work in these same professions (Moses 5:2-3). This is important for the narrative of Adam and Eve’s redemption, as it sets the stage for the commandment to offer the firstlings of their flocks as a sacrifice. In Moses, therefore, animal husbandry and animal sacrifice are already established practices by the time Cain and Abel are born, which helps to clarify why Abel’s sacrifice is accepted while Cain’s deviant vegetable offering is rejected.

³ Genesis 4:26 states that when Seth’s son Enos was born, “then began men to call upon the name of the LORD,” implying that prayer was not practiced until about 235 years after the expulsion from the Garden (Genesis 5:3, 6). In contrast, Moses 5:4-16 more prominently introduces the theme of calling upon the name of the Lord. In addition to the mention of Adam and Eve doing this in Moses 5:4, the angel tells Adam to “call upon God in the name of the Son forevermore” (Moses 5:8), Adam and Eve “bless the name of God” (Moses 5:12), and they “cease not to call upon God” (Moses 5:16). Moses 6:4 (the text corresponding to Genesis 4:26) clarifies that after Enos was born to Seth, it was only “these men,” not people in general, who “began...to call upon the name of the Lord.”

DRAFT

6 And after many days an angel of the Lord appeared unto Adam, saying: Why dost thou offer sacrifices unto the Lord? And Adam said unto him: I know not, save the Lord commanded me.

7 And then the angel spake, saying: This thing is a similitude of the sacrifice of the Only Begotten of the Father, which is full of grace and truth.

8 Wherefore, thou shalt do all that thou doest in the name of the Son, and thou shalt repent and call upon God in the name of the Son forevermore.

The text goes on to say that the Holy Ghost fell upon Adam and instructed him about the promise of redemption through the Only Begotten, after which Adam began to prophecy concerning his posterity, and he and Eve rejoiced (Moses 5:9-11). As Adam and Eve began to teach their posterity about these things, Satan came among their posterity and presented his own contrary doctrine, “and they loved Satan more than God,” thereby becoming “carnal, sensual, and devilish” (Moses 5:12-13). The Holy Ghost then called upon people everywhere and commanded them to repent (Moses 5:14-15).⁴ These events are summarized at the end of the chapter (Moses 5:58-59):

58 And thus the Gospel began to be preached, from the beginning, being declared by holy angels sent forth from the presence of God, and by his own voice, and by the gift of the Holy Ghost.

59 And thus all things were confirmed unto Adam, by an holy ordinance, and the Gospel preached, and a decree sent forth, that it should be in the world, until the end thereof; and thus it was. Amen.

Ancient Jewish, Christian, and Islamic literature contains many variations on the theme of the repentance and redemption of Adam and Eve after their expulsion from the garden. Many of the narratives are similar to the one in Moses 5:4-11, including any number of the following elements found in the Moses passage:

Adam and Eve offering prayer

God speaking to Adam and Eve

Adam and Eve offering sacrifices

Heavenly messengers instructing Adam and Eve

The order of these elements varies from one text to another according to the logic of the narrative. For instance, in some cases Adam and Eve offer sacrifice only after being instructed to do so by a heavenly messenger. However, in all cases, the elements function together within the narrative as the process by

⁴ Later in the Book of Moses, in the account of Enoch, we learn of another aspect of Adam’s redemption that is not mentioned in Moses 5, namely Adam’s baptism (Moses 6:51-68).

DRAFT

which Adam and Eve return from their fallen state to a state of favor with God. Other elements recurring in these narratives include attempts by Satan to thwart Adam and Eve through temptation, combat, or deception (compare Moses 5:13); Adam and Eve receiving a divine assurance that they can obtain salvation (compare Moses 5:9); Adam and Eve rejoicing in their redemption (compare Moses 5:10-11); and Adam prophesying of his posterity (compare Moses 5:10).

Many of these texts have been compared with the book of Moses in order to demonstrate that the book of Moses extensively incorporates ancient literary motifs.⁵ My intention in the present study is twofold: (1) to review some of the textual sources that show similarities to the Moses account, including some that have not been studied in this connection before; and (2) to take the comparative question to a deeper level and explore what the similarities and differences between the accounts can tell us about the cultural history of religious narrative. I will argue that some of the ancient narratives of Adam and Eve, along with the book of Moses, represent a specific type of text crafted to present the origin of a ritual or group of rituals. This typological approach leads to a deeper understanding both of the book of Moses and of its ancient comparanda.

Extrabiblical narratives about Adam and Eve are often found in stand-alone narrative texts. Among these we have the early apocryphal literature dating from about 200 BC to about 200 AD,⁶ Christian narratives such as the Syriac *Cave of Treasures*, and the large body of Islamic “stories of the prophets” (*qisas al-anbiyā*). The latter is notable for combining Jewish and Christian traditions about Adam and Eve with traditions based on the Qur’an.

Fragments of narratives about Adam and Eve are also found embedded in other, non-narrative texts. Such narrative fragments appear, for instance, in commentaries, magical texts, and homilies. They can even come full circle and appear as expansions in Bible translations, such as the Jewish *targumim* (Aramaic paraphrases of the Hebrew Bible). The Qur’an also contains occasional references to Adam’s life. (This parallels our own tradition, as we find references to the life of Adam and Eve embedded in the revelations of the Doctrine and Covenants and in sermons of the Prophet Joseph Smith, while the book of Moses is itself an expanded version of the first six chapters of Genesis drawn from Joseph Smith’s translation of the Bible.) Widening the scope of inquiry to include embedded narrative fragments such as these not only drastically increases the number of texts to be compared, but it also permits meaningful inquiry into the cultural history of these narratives, since the context in which the text appears is often directly related to the way in which the text was used in real life.

Before proceeding, I should clarify the approach I am taking in comparing the book of Moses with the ancient Adam literature. Given a group of texts with similar features, at least two models might be used to compare them. The more traditional one, and perhaps the one that comes most readily to mind, is the “intertextual stemma” model.⁷ According to this model, there is a relatively small number of original texts based ultimately on the Bible, and the rest of the existing literature consists of redactions from these originals. The precise mode of transmission may be written, oral, or a combination of the two. This model lies behind Michael E. Stone’s book *A History of the Literature of Adam and Eve*. Stone divides the existing texts into the two categories “primary Adam literature” and “secondary Adam literature,” the

⁵ As one among many examples, see Bruce T. Taylor, “Book of Moses,” in *Encyclopedia of Mormonism*, 216-17. Taylor compares Adam’s offering of sacrifice with the *Greek Life of Adam and Eve* (see below).

⁶ The term “Pseudepigrapha” is often used for this literature, but the term is misleading because it puts the emphasis on false authorship, which is not a key distinguishing feature of the literature in question.

⁷ This term is in use mainly in classical studies, although it serves well to describe a cross-disciplinary trend in philological research, including many studies of the Adam literature.

DRAFT

latter being derived from the former, and he devotes considerable discussion to the “literary interrelationships” of the texts.⁸

Texts may also be related to each other typologically—that is, they may share certain features which place them in a common category of text. A typological model is appropriate for comparing texts that are not necessarily historically related but that nevertheless show similar features, such as the book of Moses and the Qur’an (both are revealed texts that include stories about ancient prophets). However, the intertextual and typological models are not mutually exclusive, for two texts can be related both by derivation and by typological similarity. Typological comparisons are useful because they shed light on aspects of a text that are not easily explained by means of derivation alone, such as the relationship between a text’s content, its context, and its *Sitz im Leben* or “setting in life.”

In this paper, I take a typological approach in comparing the book of Moses with ancient apocryphal literature. In addition to yielding new insights into the topic at hand, I find this approach appealing because it allows the comparison of texts from diverse linguistic traditions and time periods without the need for speculative assumptions about historical relationships among the texts. This approach is also especially conducive to scholarly dialogue about the book of Moses, since it foregrounds the objective insights to be gained from the book, insights which are equally informative for the ancient literature.

In the following survey of sources, I have focused on literature in languages that I am reasonably competent in reading: Greek, Hebrew, Syriac, Arabic, and Coptic. Within these literatures, I have tried to be non-selective in gathering sources that cover the time period in the life of Adam and Eve represented by Moses 5, including sources that actually turn out not to contain much that is similar to the book of Moses. All these sources, including those which show little similarity to the book of Moses, are important in the typological approach. However, as the ancient literature on Adam and Eve is vast, I cannot lay claim to being comprehensive in the coverage of sources.

Early Parabiblical Literature

Perhaps the earliest surviving narrative describing what Adam and Eve did after they were driven out of the garden of Eden is found in the book of *Jubilees*. This book was composed in Hebrew, likely in the second century BC. It is therefore contemporary with the Jewish second temple. Fragments of the book were found among the Dead Sea Scrolls.

The book of *Jubilees* is framed as a revelation to Moses on mount Sinai at the time when he received the tablets of the law.⁹ The book is oriented to ritual concerns. At many points, the narrative is explicitly connected with the law written on the heavenly tablets, the same ones that contain the law of Moses. For instance, after describing the sacrifice of Noah on the first day of the third month, the text states, “Therefore, it is ordained and written in the heavenly tablets that they should observe the feast of Shavuot [the Feast of Weeks or Pentecost] in this month, once per year, in order to renew the covenant in all (respects), year by year” (*Jubilees* 6:1-3, 17). The law is thus performed as eternal, and the history is presented as mythological precedent for present observance.

⁸ Michael E. Stone, *A History of the Literature of Adam and Eve* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1992), especially pages 61-70.

⁹ The framing of this Genesis-like account as a revelation to Moses on a mountain recalls Moses 1. For discussion of this parallel, see E. Douglas Clark, “A Prologue to Genesis: Moses 1 in Light of Jewish Traditions,” *BYU Studies* 45/1 (2006): 129-42. The *Greek Life of Adam and Eve* (see below) is yet another example of this.

DRAFT

The description of events shortly after the expulsion from Eden in *Jubilees* is limited to Adam offering sacrifice. In *Jubilees* 3:27-31, just after exiting the garden of Eden, Adam offers incense and spices “as a sweet savor,” this last phrase clearly evoking biblical descriptions of animal sacrifice (Genesis 8:20-21; Exodus 29:18, 25, 41; 39 other examples in sacrificial contexts in the Pentateuch and Ezekiel). The account of Noah’s sacrifice also seems to conflate the offering of incense with animal sacrifice, as Noah offers frankincense, oil, and wine with an animal sacrifice, producing “a sweet savor” (*Jubilees* 6:1-3). Adam’s offering is described specifically as happening one day after the time when he “covered his shame” (with a fig leaf in the garden). This is mentioned as a precedent to the law in the heavenly tablets that God’s covenant people should “cover their shame,” unlike the Gentiles. R. H. Charles repeats Beer’s suggestion that this alludes to the Lord’s commandment that one offering sacrifice at the altar cover his nakedness (Exodus 20:26; 28:42-43).¹⁰ Thus one who offers sacrifice in the temple follows the pattern established by Adam when he offered sacrifice after covering his own nakedness.

The *Greek Life of Adam and Eve* (henceforth *GLAE*), also known as the *Apocalypse of Moses*, is currently disputed as to its date, original language, and religious provenance. Prior to recent studies by de Jonge and Tromp, the book was thought to date from the first century AD, to have been translated from a Hebrew original, and to be of Jewish provenance. I share this view. De Jonge and Tromp date the text to between the second and fourth centuries, argue that it was originally composed in Greek, and consider the provenance to be Christian. However, they are unable to account in a satisfactory way for the clear Hebraisms in the text, and their argument is further weakened by the fact that there are no unequivocal indications of Christian influence in the text.¹¹

Like the book of *Jubilees*, *GLAE* is framed as a revelation to Moses on mount Sinai. The book shares many structural features with the book of Moses.¹² However, in terms of content, the similarities to the book of Moses are suggestive but not very strong. Adam prays for forgiveness on two separate occasions, the first of which occurs before he is cast out of the Garden (*GLAE* 27:1-5). God promises to eventually redeem Adam and grant him eternal life, based on Adam guarding himself from all evil and preferring death; this promise is also given before the expulsion is complete, as the angels are proceeding to cast Adam out (*GLAE* 28:1-4). There is also a hint of Adam offering incense after the expulsion (as in *Jubilees*), but the event is not described directly; instead, Adam, as he is just about to be driven out, gathers crocus, nard, reed, and cinnamon for the purpose (*GLAE* 29:1-6). Adam’s second prayer, subsequent to the expulsion, is performed as he stands in the Jordan River for forty days, with all the

¹⁰ Charles, *Book of Jubilees or the Little Genesis*, 27n27. In Exodus 20:26, God seems to be prescribing a ritual performance for all the children of Israel, to whom he is speaking. Later, in Exodus 28:42-43, it is specifically Aaron and his sons who are to wear linen breeches when they minister at the altar.

¹¹ De Jonge and Tromp accept the attempt by Stone and Bohak to explain as typical Greek features the Hebraisms noted by Sharpe and accepted by M. D. Johnson. Stone and Bohak admit to not having seen Sharpe’s work (Stone, *History of the Literature*, 44n8), and they seem to miss the point in some cases. For instance, in Stone, *History of the Literature*, 49, the “tree that oil goes out of it” is abbreviated and then described as a normal Greek construction. The fact that the Bible being quoted is the Septuagint is also immaterial to the original language of the text, for the Septuagint was certainly familiar to the Greek translator and its language could have been used in the translation, much as the language of the King James Bible was used in the translation of the Book of Mormon. See Johnson, in *OTP*, 2:251-52; Stone, *History of the Literature*, 42-61; De Jonge and Tromp, *Life of Adam and Eve*, 65-78.

¹² David Calabro, “Of Moses, Mountains, and Models: Joseph Smith’s Book of Moses in Dialogue with the Greek Life of Adam and Eve,” forthcoming.

DRAFT

birds, animals, and reptiles standing in a circle around him and praying on his behalf.¹³ Meanwhile, Adam tells Eve to stand in the Tigris for thirty-four days and pray silently, “O God, be gracious to me.” She initially succeeds in her prayer, but the devil comes to her in the form of an angel and persuades her to come out of the water (*GLAE* 29:7-17).¹⁴

In the *Apocalypse of Adam*, a Gnostic work from Egypt dating to the first or second century, “three men” impart a revelation to Adam, and he imparts the knowledge to his son Seth.¹⁵ There is no reference to prayer at all, only “sleeping in the thought of my heart.” One could, perhaps, see an oblique reference to the fall and then some form of ritual activity prior to the appearance of the three men: “After those days the eternal knowledge of the God of truth withdrew from me and your mother Eve. Since that time we learned about dead things, like men. Then we recognized the God who created us, for we were not strangers to his powers, and we served him in fear and subjection.” However, while the idea of three heavenly messengers visiting Adam and Eve has parallels elsewhere in the Latter-day Saint tradition, the parallel to the book of Moses is not very strong at all.¹⁶

Jewish Literature

Early Rabbinic literature mentions Adam offering animal sacrifice after his expulsion from the garden. One source is *Avot d-Rabbi Nathan*, composed between the first and third centuries CE and compiled between the seventh and ninth centuries. According to this source, Adam was afraid as the sun set and the world darkened on the night after his expulsion. But when the sun rose in the morning, Adam was filled with thanks, and he arose, built an altar, and offered as a sacrifice a bull whose horns came into being before its hoofs (i.e., a primordial bull, one that was created rather than born, based on an exegesis of Psalm 69:32).¹⁷ The *Talmud* repeats this story, adding the detail that prior to the sacrifice, throughout the night, Adam fasted and cried, and Eve opposite him (*Babylonian Talmud*, Avodah Zarah 8a). This seems similar to the sacrifice described in Moses 5:4-5.

Much stronger parallels to the book of Moses are found in *Sefer Razi'el*, a magical text dating to the thirteenth century AD at the latest, but first known from a version printed in Amsterdam in 1701.¹⁸ The book itself contains various recipes and formulas for all sorts of purposes, including predicting the future.

¹³ The act of standing in the Jordan river recalls the sevenfold cleansing of Naaman in the Jordan (2 Kings 5:9-14). The Jordan river was associated with the passage of Israel into the promised land (Joshua 3) and served as a natural border of the land of Israel. Thus, in addition to its association with cleansing, the river easily symbolizes a liminal state of passage from profane to holy space, a symbolism evident in the river's use as a place of baptism (Matthew 3:13-17; Mark 1:9-11; Luke 3:21-22; John 1:28, 32-34). Nevertheless, a clear association with Christian baptism is absent from *GLAE* 29.

¹⁴ See translation by M. D. Johnson, in Charlesworth, *OTP*, 2:259, 261, 285.

¹⁵ The idea of three heavenly messengers being sent to teach Adam is also found in the Mandaeen *Ginza Rba* (a book of scripture occasionally known in the literature as *Sidra Rba* or as the *Book of Adam*), which has Gnostic roots. For discussion of this theme in a comparative light, see Hugh W. Nibley, “The Early Christian Prayer Circle,” in *Mormonism and Early Christianity* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book and FARMS), 60; Jeffrey M. Bradshaw, *In God's Image and Likeness: Ancient and Modern Perspectives on the Book of Moses* (Salt Lake City: Eborn, 2010), 869.

¹⁶ Charlesworth, *OTP*, 1:712-13.

¹⁷ *Avot d-Rabbi Nathan* 1:8; see Goldin, *Fathers according to Rabbi Nathan*, 14.

¹⁸ The dating to the thirteenth century is based on the existence of a Latin translation produced under king Alfonso X (r. 1252-1284), entitled *Liber Razielis Archangeli*.

DRAFT

The prologue, however, explains how the book was revealed by the angel Raziel to Adam shortly after his expulsion from the garden. This opening section of the book is worth quoting in extenso:¹⁹

This is the first prayer of Adam, which he prayed in the hour that he was driven from the garden of Eden, before this holy book²⁰ was given him. And he supplicated before the Divine Majesty and said, O LORD God of the universe, you created the whole universe for glory, honor, and strength, and you have done according to your will, and your kingdom is forever and ever, and your splendor from generation to generation, and there is nothing concealed from you, and there is nothing hidden from before your eyes. And you established me over the works of your hands, and you gave me dominion over all your creations, to be a ruler over your works. But the cunning, cursed serpent enticed me with the tree of desire and envy. And also, since the wife of my bosom enticed me, and you did not inform me what would be, and what would be for my children, and what would come upon me and for the generations coming after me. And I knew and understood that no living thing is justified before you. And what is my strength that I would dare be insolent against you? I have no mouth to answer a word, and no eye to lift up, for I have sinned and done wickedly, and for my wrong-doing I have been driven out this day, and I am tilling and digging into the earth, to work that from which I was taken.²¹ And there is no dread or fear of me on the ranges of the earth as there was in the beginning, for from the time that I ate of the tree of knowledge and transgressed your word, my wisdom vanished from me, and I am empty and know not, foolish and understand not what will be. And now, O most compassionate and merciful God, return to your first-formed, to the spirit that you inbreathed, to the soul that you gave. Prefer me in your mercy, for you are merciful, longsuffering, and abundant in mercy. May my prayer come up before the throne of your glory, and may my cry reach the throne of your mercy, that you may grant me your favor. And may the words of my mouth be accepted before you.²² Do not hide from my supplication. You have been and will be forever; you have ruled and will rule. Please have compassion on the work of your hands, and let me understand and know what will happen to the generations of my posterity, and what will come upon me each day and each month. Do not conceal the wisdom of your Help (another reading: your Watchers) and your angels.

After three days of his supplications, the angel Raziel came to him while he was sitting by the river that went forth from the garden of Eden. And he appeared to him during the time when the sun is hottest, and in his hand was a book. And he said to him: Adam, why are you desolate? Why do you grieve and sorrow? From the day that you stood in prayer

¹⁹ The translation from the Hebrew is my own, based on the 1701 Amsterdam edition, 3ab, and the 1944 edition, 3ab.

²⁰ הספר הקדוש הזה: Here and elsewhere in what follows, “this book” refers to the present book, Sefer Raziel itself.

²¹ ואני בוקע ופולח בארץ לעבוד את אשר ממנה לקחתי: The verb לקחתי is a Pual. There is a double entendre here, given the double meanings of the terms פלח ‘dig; serve’ and עבד ‘work, tend (as in Genesis 2:5, 15); serve’. The implication is one of ironic reversal: Adam is now serving the very ground that he was taken from.

²² יהיו לרצון אמרי פי לפניך: “may the words of my mouth be accepted before you”: This quotes Psalm 19:15.

Compare also Psalm 54:4. In all these cases, the reference to “the words of my mouth” occurs in the context of a supplicatory prayer. Here, unlike in the Psalms, these words are parts of Adam’s prayer as he prays for light and knowledge after being expelled from the garden of Eden.

DRAFT

and supplications, your words were heard, and I have come to cause you to understand pure promises and great wisdom, and to make you wise through the words of this holy book. By them you will know what will happen to you until the day of your death. And as for every man of your children who will stand in your place,²³ and all later generations that will be guided by this holy book in purity, with an honest heart and a humble spirit, and shall do all that is written therein like you, he shall know what will come on each month, and between day and night. And all things shall be revealed to him, and he shall understand and know if there will be evil, hunger, an infestation, rains, or dearth, whether the crop yield will be great or small, whether the wicked will rule over the world, if there will be one or another kind of locust, if a tree will let its fruit fall, if there will be a plague of boils on the children of men, if there will be wars, if there will be suffering, if death will rule over the children of men or over animals, if a good decree or a bad one will come forth from above, and whether blood will be spilt or a throat will be strangled in the city. So you, Adam, draw near and pay attention, and I will instruct you in the ways of this book and its holiness.

And the angel Raziel opened the book and read in Adam's ears. And it happened that when he heard the words of this holy book from the mouth of the angel Raziel, he fell on his face trembling. And he said: Adam, arise. Be strong and do not fear or be afraid, but take this book from my hand and take care of it, for from it you will come to know and discern, and you will instruct everybody who takes possession of it, that it might be his portion. And at the time that Adam took this book, fire rose in a column on the bank of the river, and the angel went up in a flame of fire to heaven. Then Adam understood and knew that he was an angel of God, and that this book was sent from before the Holy King, and he took hold of it in holiness and purity. And these are the words of the book: If a man seeks to have success and to do anything from it, he shall count three days before the coming of the first day of a new month. He should not eat anything that is doubtful as to uncleanness, or anything that releases blood, and he should not drink wine, and he should not go as usual to the bed of a woman. And on those days he should wash with water before the rising of the sun, and he should bring two white turtledoves and slaughter them with a two-edged bronze knife. He should slaughter the first with the first edge and the second with the second. Then he should scoop out their innards and wash them with water. Then he should bring three shekels of aged wine, pure frankincense, and some pure and clear honey, and mix them together with the innards of the turtledoves. Then he should fill them (i.e. the turtledoves). Then he should cut them up into pieces and put them on the coals before the rising of the sun. And he should be wrapped in a white garment. And he should stand and walk barefoot while reciting the names of the ministering angels of that month in which he is enquiring. And he should burn everything of the pieces day by day, three times per day, every piece.²⁴ And on the third day he

²³ "every man...who will stand in your place": "man" here is אָדָם "man, Adam." This brings up the idea of playing the role of Adam, an initiate acting in his role, a lamination of the mythological precedent and the current ritual.

²⁴ Slaughtering two turtledoves, burning the entrails with wine and incense: The implication is that Adam too performed this ritual on the bank of the river before the angel appeared to him. Note that the ritual takes place three days before the first day of a month, which matches the appearance of the angel to Adam. This is the first ritual of the book itself, and it is the initiatory ritual that prepares the person to use the book. An angelic epiphany is the direct result of the ritual, which then leads to the initiate being able to tap into the book's power. So this is

DRAFT

should bring all the ashes and sprinkle them on the ground in the midst of the house. And he should sleep upon it and recite upon it the names of the noble, strong, mighty, holy, ruling angels. And he should sleep and not speak with any person. And the angels will come to him in the night in vision, visibly and not in riddles. And they will instruct him and reveal to him everything concerning which he enquires without fear.

This prologue shows elements that are similar to Moses 5:4-11: Adam prays, and an angel appears to him and gives him special knowledge pertaining to his salvation. Adam also receives knowledge about his posterity and is empowered to prophesy of the future. The motif of a sacred book is absent from Moses 5, but it is found later in the Book of Moses (see Moses 6:5-6, 46). The ritual prescription at the end of the quotation implicitly connects with the sacrifice in Moses 5, since the sacrifice is said to yield an angelic epiphany like the one Adam had.

Eastern Christian Literature

The Syriac apocryphal narrative known as the *Cave of Treasures*, dating to around the fifth century AD, contains very little that might be compared with the book of Moses. At the beginning of Cave of Treasures chapter 5, where Adam is driven out of the garden of Eden, there is no prayer, no sacrifice, and no angelic visitation. Just before the expulsion, however, God reveals to Adam the coming of his Son, through whom Adam and his posterity would be saved. When Adam and Eve leave paradise, they come immediately to a cave, where Adam deposits gold, frankincense, and myrrh. The text continues, “and he blessed and sanctified it (i.e. the cave), that it might be a house of prayer for them and their posterity, and he called it the Cave of Treasures.”²⁵ Altogether, although the *Cave of Treasures* contains much by way of temple symbolism relevant to Latter-day Saints,²⁶ it is not a very close comparandum to the book of Moses itself.

The Coptic text known to modern scholars as the *Investiture of Abbaton* (or, in some sources, the *Discourse on Abbaton*), dating to between the fifth and sixth centuries AD, is specifically described as a revelation by Christ to the apostles after his resurrection, which was written in a book and discovered in Jerusalem in the house of an old man by Timothy, archbishop of Alexandria. This text shows some similarity to the narrative about Adam in *Cave of Treasures*, but it has one additional detail that is significant for comparison with the book of Moses, namely an angelic visitation to Adam. Here the visitation happens subsequently to a conflict between Adam and Satan. The text is also explicitly connected to a ritual observance, a feast to be held regularly on day 13 of the month of Hathor.

These elements occur in the narrative as follows: Before Adam and Eve are expelled from the garden, God reveals to them all about the future ministry of Christ to atone for their transgression. After they are expelled from the garden, Satan comes to Adam and declares himself as Adam’s adversary. In order to deliver Adam, God puts him under the charge of the angel Mouriel, whom he names Abbaton. God tells the angel that people should give gifts and repent on this specific day, day 13 of the month of Hathor.

an example of a ritual prescription based on a mythological precedent, even though the precedent for the sacrifice is implicit.

²⁵ ܠܝܢ ܕܝܫܘܢ ܡܝܫܘܥ ܡܫܘܥܐ ܕܡܫܝܚܐ ܕܝܫܘܥ ܕܡܫܝܚܐ ܕܝܫܘܥ ܕܡܫܝܚܐ ܕܝܫܘܥ ܕܡܫܝܚܐ.

²⁶ See Bradshaw, *In God’s Image and Likeness*, 669-75.

DRAFT

Then the angel goes down to purify Adam.²⁷ As in *Cave of Treasures*, there is no mention of Adam offering prayer or sacrifice.

Perhaps the closest parallel to Moses 5:4-11 in all of ancient literature is the Christian Arabic text known as the *Conflict of Adam and Eve with Satan*.²⁸ The text dates to between the eighth and ninth centuries AD. An Ethiopic version, translated from the Arabic, was produced around the eleventh century.²⁹

The Conflict with Adam and Eve with Satan begins with a brief description of the geography of the area surrounding Paradise. Then it launches into a narrative of the expulsion of Adam and Eve and the things that happened to them afterwards. The text is intertextually related to the *Cave of Treasures*, since Adam and Eve take up residence in that cave after being driven out of Paradise.³⁰ However, the *Conflict of Adam and Eve* is more expansive in its narrative of these events than the *Cave of Treasures* (although the *Cave of Treasures* covers a larger sweep of history).

In this text, Adam and Eve are cast out of the garden westward, reversing the Hebrew Bible's statement that the cherubim are placed at the east (implying that they are cast out eastward). The feature of Adam and Eve being cast out toward the west is also found in other Eastern Christian apocryphal narratives such as the Hexaemeron of Pseudo-Epiphanius. This relates to the fact that Christian churches have their door facing west, unlike the Jewish temple in Jerusalem, whose door faced east. Just as a priest entering the temple would symbolically reverse the fall to return into God's presence, passing the cherubim that decorated the doors, Christian worshippers would pray toward the east and approach toward the east for communion, thus also symbolically reversing the fall.³¹

Immediately after entering the *Cave of Treasures* for the first time, Adam and Eve pray "in a language unknown to us but known to them."³² While praying, Adam lifts his gaze and sees the rock of the cave intervening between him and heaven. He beats his breast and falls down. Eve then stands and lifts up her hands and prays, and she eventually falls down too. God finally sends his voice to lift Adam and Eve up.³³

²⁷ Budge, *Coptic Martyrdoms*, 1:225-49 (Coptic), 474-96 (English).

²⁸ The Arabic text was edited by Battista and Bagatti in 1982, based on the manuscript Vat ar 129, which dates to 1679 but is based on a much older copy according to the colophon. Some manuscripts containing this text have been digitized by the Hill Museum and Manuscript Library (HMML), including HMML project numbers BALA 118; CFMM 250; GAMS 1250; MGMT 153.

²⁹ Battista and Bagatti, *Combattimento di Adamo*, 28; Stone, *History of the Literature of Adam and Eve*, 98n70. Note that Stone accepts Frey's date of "later than the seventh century" for the Ethiopic version, but the seventh century is much too early for the Christian Arabic composition, let alone the rendering into Ethiopic.

³⁰ The title of the work in Arabic is *قصة ادم وحوها وما جرى لهما بعد خروجهما من الفردوس ومقامهما في مغارة الكنوز بأمر الخالق لهما* "Story of Adam and Eve and what happened to them after their departure from Paradise, and their dwelling in the Cave of Treasures according to the commandment of the Creator to them, may he be praised and exalted."

³¹ See Donald W. Parry, "Garden of Eden: Prototype Sanctuary," in *Temples of the Ancient World: Ritual and Symbolism*, ed. Donald W. Parry (Salt Lake and Provo: Deseret and FARMS, 1994), 126-51. Ibn Siba connects Adam and Eve's westward expulsion with the Christian custom of praying toward the east: see Battista and Bagatti, *Combattimento di Adamo*, 131, 169-70.

³² On the motif of praying in an unknown language in apocryphal literature, see Nibley, "Early Christian Prayer Circle," in *Mormonism and Early Christianity*, 56-58; Jeffrey M. Bradshaw, David J. Larsen, and Stephen T. Whitlock, "Moses 1 and the Apocalypse of Abraham: Twin Sons of Different Mothers?" *Interpreter* 38 (2020): 275-76n230.

³³ Battista and Bagatti, *Combattimento*, 37. God sends his voice (صوت) many times in this text to strengthen Adam after he falls into a swoon. God's Voice as an active agent is based on an interpretation of Genesis 3:8: וישמעו את

DRAFT

On their second excursion from the cave, Adam and Eve try to climb up the mountain to reenter Paradise. As they draw near to the western door of Paradise and weep there, they feel the heat of Paradise burn their faces. The heat is so intense that first Adam and then Eve throw themselves down from the height and lie there bleeding until God sends his voice to raise them up. Then Adam and Eve offer their first sacrifice.³⁴ They take rocks and make an altar.³⁵ Then they take leaves from outside Paradise and anoint them with their blood from the ground where they had fallen. Then they “lift it up upon the altar like sacrifices before God.”³⁶ Then they stand at the foot of the altar weeping and beseeching God for mercy, and asking that their offering be accepted “like the prayers we used to offer in Paradise.” God marvels at this act by Adam and Eve, who, the text says explicitly, have not been commanded to make this offering. He has mercy and responds by sending a “brilliance” (نورانية) from his presence that burns the offering. He smells the sweet savor and has pity on Adam and Eve. He then sends his voice and tells Adam about his own coming in the flesh and his own sacrifice that will happen, in which his blood will be shed “on the altar” for the forgiveness of sins. The narrator then says that Adam continues to perform this sacrifice as a regular observance.³⁷

On their eleventh excursion, Satan appears to Adam and Eve and gloats over them, telling them that they are under his power, and there is none who can rescue them until the day of promise, when God will come to save them; but since the hour has not yet come, Satan declares that he will intensify his combat against Adam and his posterity. Adam and Eve pray with extended hands for God to drive Satan away from them, and not to let him have power over them, that he might not overcome them and make them deny God. As soon as they finish praying, God sends an angel and drives Satan away from them.³⁸

On their seventeenth excursion, Adam and Eve offer their second sacrifice. They take wheat from a field and make from it an offering. They climb with it up to the mountain on which they offered their blood in their first sacrifice, and they “lift it up upon the altar.”³⁹ Adam and Eve stand and pray for God to accept their sacrifice. God replies to them: “As you have made these offerings to me, I will make it with my body in the time when I descend to the earth, and I will save you, and I will cause it to be lifted up upon the altar for forgiveness and mercy for those who worthily partake of it.”⁴⁰ The text continues, “Then God

They heard the voice of the LORD God walking in the garden in the cool of the day.” Here, at least from a grammatical standpoint, it is not clear whether it is God or his voice that is “walking in the garden.” But this also recalls Moses 5:4: “and they heard the voice of the Lord from the way toward the Garden of Eden, speaking unto them, and they saw him not; for they were shut out from his presence.”

³⁴ The manuscript Vat ar 129 has a rubric, rare in this manuscript, introducing this section: “the first sacrifice which Adam lifted up.”

³⁵ On the word هيكل, usually ‘temple’, used to mean ‘altar’, see Dozy 2:775: “Par synecdoche, autel”; “Table d’autel,” citing the Muhit al-Muhit under مائدة: “some Christians use it (i.e. the ma’idah) for the offering table upon which the priest places what he sanctifies after he transfers it from the altar.”

³⁶ Battista and Bagatti appropriately render قرابين as “offerte,” for the word قرابين does carry the original sense of ‘sacrificial offering’; however, in a Christian context the word means ‘Eucharist’, and this sense is also meaningful here.

³⁷ وصرار هذه عادة لادم. It is doubtful that the text means to say that Adam continued to use his own blood in observing this rite; perhaps it is implied that wine was used as in the Eucharist. On the passage as a whole, see Battista and Bagatti, *Combattimento*, 51-56.

³⁸ Battista and Bagatti, *Combattimento*, 98-99. This passage is very similar to the narrative in the *Investiture of Abbaton* (compare also Moses 5:13).

³⁹ ورفعوا هذا القرابين أيضا علي الهيكل الذي كانوا بنوه اولاً

⁴⁰ كما انكم صنعتهم هذه القرابين ورفعتموهم الي ان اجعله جسدي في الوقت الذي انزل فيه الي الأرض واخلصكم واجعله دايم يرفع علي الهيكل مغفوره ورحمه للذين يتناولون منه باستحقاق

DRAFT

Note here that the text is strongly Christian; it assumes that Adam and Eve knew of Christ and of the resurrection. The first person plural of the prayer implies that Adam and Eve offer this prayer together. In the wider apotropaic context of the Book of Protection, there may be an implicit association between this prayer and Adam's expulsion from the garden, when he became vulnerable to the evils of the world, near the time of his combat with Satan. This would also, then, be part of the narrative of Adam's repentance and redemption.

Islamic Literature

The Qur'an, revealed to the Prophet Muhammad between 609 and 632 AD, contains three passages that touch on Adam's redemption after his expulsion from the garden of Eden. Q 2:30-39 recounts in brief the story of Adam in premortality and in the garden of Eden. This passage mentions enigmatically that as Adam is about to be cast out, he receives from God certain words and is thereby able to return to God's favor.⁴⁷ God then sends Adam and Eve down to earth, promising to send them "guidance." In Q 7:11-27, once again, the story of Adam in premortality and in the garden of Eden is related. After their transgression, God tells Adam and Eve to go down to the earth; "therein you shall live," he says, "and therein you shall die, and from there you shall be brought forth. Children of Adam! We have sent down on you a garment...the garment of godfearing...that is one of God's signs; haply they will remember." Finally, in Q 20:120-121, Adam and Eve are cast out, and God promises to guide them back.

Between the eighth and the fourteenth centuries AD, the Islamic world saw the development of a genre of literature known as *qisas al-anbiyā'* or "stories of the prophets," recounting extracanonical stories about biblical and Qur'anic prophets.

The earliest extant example of a book in this genre is that of Ishaq ibn Bishr (d. 821 AD). His work survives in one unpublished manuscript at the Bodleian Library at Oxford University (MS Huntingdon 388, dating to 1203 AD) and in fragments found in the Zahiriyā Library in Damascus. There are two main passages of interest for the comparison with Moses 5:4-11. In one passage, Adam is weeping, and the angel Gabriel comes to him and asks why he is weeping. Adam replies that it is because he has been cast out from the house of grace to the house of evil. Gabriel then returns and reports to God. God then sends Gabriel down a second time with a message of salvation for Adam. Adam offers a fervent prayer in which he confesses that there is no God but Allah and pleads for mercy and pardon. God then teaches Adam "the words" (كلمات) so that Adam is able to be reconciled with God.⁴⁸ In another passage, Adam and Eve pray for forgiveness, and God sends down mercy. God tells Adam, "If you repent, I will return you to the garden." Adam says, as if in disbelief, "If I repent, you will return me to the Garden?" God says, "Yes." Then Adam immediately repents.⁴⁹

⁴⁷ The Islamic *tafsir* (Qur'anic commentary) literature generally regards these "words" (*kalimāt*) as the words of a prayer or a form of the *shahādah* (the Muslim confession of faith). However, some commentators connect these words with the "names" (*asmā'*) which God teaches Adam in order to test him in front of the angels, as described earlier in the same passage. The enigmatic references to the "names" and "words" in this passage are, in any case, suggestive of esoteric knowledge. For further references and discussion, see Bradshaw, *In God's Image and Likeness*, 177-79.

⁴⁸ Fol. 50v:11 to fol. 51r:16.

⁴⁹ Fol. 54r:8-14.

DRAFT

The world history of Al-Ṭabarī (d. 923), entitled *Tārīkh al-rusul wa-al-mulūk*, contains many passages derived from the genre of “stories of the prophets.” This work mentions Adam being commanded to offer prayer at a special holy place: “Adam, I have cast down a house for you to circumambulate, as one circumambulates my throne, and to pray at it as one prays at my throne.” There is also the slaughter of a ram, although it is used for making clothing rather than for a sacrificial offering: “Then, when God saw the nakedness of Adam and Eve, He commanded Adam to slaughter a ram from the eight couples of small cattle He had sent down from Paradise. Adam took the ram and slaughtered it. Then he took its wool, and Eve spun it. He and Eve wove it. Adam made a coat for himself, and a shift and veil for Eve. They put on that clothing. Then God revealed to Adam: I have a sacred territory around my throne. Go and build a house for me there! Then crowd around it, as you have seen my angels crowd around my throne. There I shall respond to you and all your children who are obedient to me.” Again, this connects Adam’s redemption with rites performed on sacred space, not only by Adam himself but also by his posterity. This notion continues later in the text: “When he finished with its construction, the angel went out with him to ‘Arafat. He showed him all the rites (connected with the pilgrimage) that people perform today. Then he went with him to Mecca, and (Adam) circumambulated the house for a week.”⁵⁰

Stories of the prophets by Al-Tha‘labī (d. 1036) and Al-Ṭarafī (d. 1062) contain much the same material as Al-Ṭabarī.⁵¹

The work of Al-Kisā‘ī (12th century) is rich with material about Adam’s redemption, more than other transmitters of stories of the prophets, although it also contains many of the same elements as the others. In one portion of the narrative, God commands Adam to worship him and to pray: “Stretch forth thy hands and call upon me, for I am nigh and responsive.”⁵² Adam calls upon God, and Gabriel is sent by God to teach Adam the words. Gabriel causes a spring to gush forth, in which Adam bathes. Gabriel then clothes Adam with “two robes of heavenly brocade.” God sends the angel Michael to Eve, and he clothes her. God commands Adam to build “his House” in Mecca, which is the Kaaba, and to circumambulate it and pray there.⁵³

Following this, Adam has a personal encounter with God in which God touches Adam’s loins with his right hand to make a covenant with Adam’s posterity. Adam’s posterity are in two groups: those on the right and those on the left. Those on the right covenant to worship God.⁵⁴ Adam goes to Mecca to perform the rites. “After Gabriel taught him the rites, Adam rose and was vested with the pilgrimage garb. Gabriel took him by the hand and circumambulated the House seven times, taught him all the rites of pilgrimage and made him stand at all the stations. Afterwards he returned him to the House and commanded him to circumambulate seven times. When he had finished, Gabriel said, ‘This is sufficient for you, Adam. You are absolved, your repentance has been accepted, and your wife has also been absolved. Pray to your Lord to heed your prayer.’”⁵⁵

⁵⁰ Rosenthal 1989, 293-95; see also pages 301-2.

⁵¹ Brinner, *Lives of the Prophets*, 1:60; Tottoli, *Storie dei profeti*, 45.

⁵² Thackston, *Tales of the Prophets*, 52-53.

⁵³ Thackston, *Tales of the Prophets*, 59-62.

⁵⁴ This passage echoes accounts of prophetic visions in earlier apocryphal literature. See Bradshaw, Larsen, and Whitlock, “Moses 1 and the Apocalypse of Abraham,” 199-202, 259n140. For further discussion of this motif in Islamic literature, see M. J. Kister, “Adam: A Study of Some Legends in Tafsir and Hadith Literature,” *Israel Oriental Studies* 13 (1993): 154-59.

⁵⁵ Thackston, *Tales of the Prophets*, 63-67.

DRAFT

Ibn Kathīr (d. 1373) is the last major transmitter of stories of the prophets. While earlier transmitters had incorporated extensive lore from Jewish and Christian sources, by Ibn Kathīr's time these non-Muslim traditions or *Isrā'īliyāt* were systematically purged out of the tradition. At times, this purging extended to doubtful traditions that were essentially Islamic but associated with unreliable transmitters or similar to non-Islamic lore. Not surprisingly, therefore, there is nothing in Ibn Kathir's *Qisas al-anbiyā'* about Adam's repentance and redemption.

Typological Analysis

As we see from this survey, there are texts with significant similarities to Moses 5 in Jewish, Christian, and Islamic literature. The closest comparanda seem to be *Sefer Razel*, the *Conflict of Adam and Eve with Satan*, and Al-Kisā'ī's collection of stories of the prophets. This presents us with a very interesting problem, namely that the closest comparanda to the book of Moses are the later texts.

Of course, it is possible that these later texts preserve older threads of narrative that do not survive in older manuscripts or that have not been discovered yet. But it is difficult to build an argument on this assumption, since the book of Moses itself is not fixed in time. Joseph Smith never indicated exactly what time period the book belongs to. Given that the restored readings in Moses 5 are not found on copies of Genesis in the Dead Sea Scrolls, a date before the Babylonian Exile, giving enough time for the readings to be lost, is possible.⁵⁶ Several aspects of the narrative, particularly the Christological passages, would fit well with an early Christian context. It is also possible that different parts of the revealed portions of the book of Moses belong to different time periods, reflecting a complex redaction history like that of the Bible itself. Given that Joseph Smith's translation process is also imperfectly understood, some parts of the revealed portions may be ancient while others may not. Ultimately, the search for intertextual relationships leaves us in the realm of the suggestive, with no concrete conclusions. Meanwhile, those who follow this intertextual approach but do not accept the historicity of the book of Moses would tend to argue for the opposite direction of borrowing, that Joseph Smith got ideas for the book of Moses by reading apocryphal literature. This, too, is very problematic due to the lack of evidence. This approach, overall, gives us very little basis for interconfessional scholarly dialogue.

I believe that a more solid comparison between the book of Moses and the ancient apocrypha is possible by taking a typological approach. This approach begins with the observation that the book of Moses and its closest comparanda share one salient feature other than the similarity in contents: they are all oriented in a specific way to ritual performances. The book of Moses, in chapters 5-6, provides a doctrinal basis for the law of sacrifice and the ordinance of baptism; the book also lays out in textual form the pattern of expulsion from paradise, repentance, and being brought back into God's presence, which pattern the temple endowment embodies.⁵⁷

⁵⁶ It is worth noting that there are multiple close parallels between parts of the Book of Moses and the Enoch literature found among the Dead Sea Scrolls, although these parallels mostly lie outside the passages about Adam and Eve that are the focus of the present study. For a review of some of the parallels, see Jeffrey M. Bradshaw and Ryan Dahle, "Could Joseph Smith Have Drawn on Ancient Manuscripts When He Translated the Story of Enoch? Recent Updates on a Persistent Question," *Interpreter* 33 (2019): 305-73. This could support either a pre-exilic or an early Christian context of the Book of Moses.

⁵⁷ Jeffrey M. Bradshaw, "The LDS Story of Enoch as the Culminating Episode of a Temple Text," *BYU Studies* 53/1 (2014): 39-73; David Calabro, "Joseph Smith and the Architecture of Genesis," in *The Temple: Ancient and Restored*, ed. Stephen D. Ricks and Donald W. Parry (Salt Lake City: Eborn Books, 2016), 165-81.

DRAFT

We have seen that *Jubilees* similarly establishes precedents for ritual observances, particularly those connected with the calendar of feasts. I have argued elsewhere that *GLAE* is likewise linked to ritual, but it is the ritual of burial, which is not very close to the concerns of the book of Moses.⁵⁸ *Sefer Raziel* and the Syriac *Book of Protection* are both magical texts that cite events in Adam's life as a basis for the use of the book itself to exert power over the supernatural world. The *Investiture of Abbaton* is designed as a festal homily and may relate in some way to the ritual performances observed on that feast day, although the specifics of this are unclear. The closest parallel to the book of Moses, the Arabic *Conflict of Adam and Eve with Satan*, establishes a precedent for the Christian Eucharist, which is precisely analogous to the sacrificial ritual with Christ-centered meaning described in Moses 5:4-11. And finally, the Islamic tradition of stories of the prophets connects Adam's redemption with the building of the sanctuary in Mecca and the performance of rites there by later believers, including the circumambulation of the Kaaba and the offering of prayer.

When a narrative about a past event is used to explain why a ritual is performed in the present, and often to lend the present performance authority and efficacy, that narrative is known as a "mythological precedent" (note that the word *mythological* here does not have the connotation of lacking historicity). A good example of a mythological precedent is the story of the Last Supper in the Gospels, which provides an explanation, authority, and efficacy to the sacrament. It is likely that all of these narratives are similar because they were written to serve in a similar way as mythological precedents for rituals. The likeness in function gives rise to a likeness in form.

The interpretation of these texts as mythological precedents does not exclude explanations based on common ancestry or derivation. What it does, however, is permit an analysis of the content of these narratives in terms of how they relate to implied contexts, skirting the potential pitfalls of speculative textual histories. The book of Moses is especially informative because the context in which the text was revealed is actually evident in contemporary sources, including original manuscripts and accounts of the translation process. Thus the study of the book of Moses paves the way for studies of other ancient narratives, whose contexts are less directly evident.

This investigation of the typology of religious narratives suggests the need for a deeper engagement both with the revealed ancient scripture of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and with ancient narrative literature in general. I believe that this brief study outlines a way in which scholars of diverse persuasions can successfully meet in dialogue about these texts.

⁵⁸ Calabro, "Of Moses, Mountains, and Models."